

Casablanca Dream
Women Weave Peace into Globalisation
12-15 Jan 2007

Invoking Gyana, Women's knowing,
as a vehicle for rebellion*

a background paper

by

Devaki Jain

December 27th, 2006

* The GYANA meaning knowledge, often in the pratyaxa=immediate sense, hence "experience" .**Knowing namely gyana, is power**

Knowledge is universal; it can be in a book or in a computer. Anyone can and should have access to it. **Knowing is individual and cannot be transferred to some one else. Others can perceive it, observe it and get influenced by it, but it cannot be transferred directly**

<http://www.hindunet.com/forum/showflat.php?Cat=15,44&Number=10144&Main=10144>

My purpose

In my analysis of successful, in the sense of enduring, revolution, I found that what is needed is an idea and this has to be backed by a mass movement. Whether it was Marx who had an idea that generated the interest of the working class, and bound them together in revolution,- an idea that still stays with us and inspires; or Gandhi whose ideas generated effective mass movements of resistance. It seems that there is need for a synergy of the two. My analysis of Gandhi's technique encourages me to think that an idea, a rebellious idea, backed by resistance, backed by mass mobilization can in fact generate a peaceful revolution. Gandhi called it *satyagraha*,¹ *Satya* meaning truth; and *agraha* meaning affirmation.

Further, my investigation of the historical evolution of women's efforts, - through my recent book and the innumerable exposures I have had, to experience on the ground, through field work and participation in meetings, in India; as well as all the many world and regional conferences, whether as struggle or as uncovering of knowledge, or challenging the existent/the given - suggests that women, especially their knowledge, their **knowing**, *Gyana*, can be the new entrant which can construct a theory/that idea , and re shape the current world order .

It is also my reading of history that campaigning by itself, is a necessary but not a sufficient condition for change. There has to be a core theory,- in fact theory survives history even more than practice as we see from Marx and Gandhi - so an analytically powerful idea, **a truth** which grips the imagination, **and** the felt need of a mass, has an impact which makes a difference .

In this context, what I would like to see happening in Casablanca is a collective drawing on the "*well*" of women's knowing, *gyana*, in order to reconstruct or birth an "idea", **a truth** out of the collective experience of women's thinking /-intellection/ knowing. The idea or analysis , has to be such that it grips the women's movement, which I postulate as the "mass"., and lead them to rebellion, to **satyagraha** .

In working on my recent book I found that every possible conduit was used by women to reveal what Faye Harrison so beautifully calls "*Difference,(In)equality*

¹ MK Gandhi, The story of my experiments with truth, The Navajivan Trust, 1927, Ahmedabad

and Justice ²: Uncovering of facts, new facts, facts that denied or invalidated old facts; covert and overt strategizing in large and small public forums, both scholarly as well as policy oriented, massive campaigning over decades in ever widening circles of coverage. But the trudge and crunch of the “traditional” thinking, the old categories, have not changed nor accommodated the revolutionary aspects of *women’s knowing. gyana,*

At Casablanca through the method of dialogue, twelve? or more or less of us, not Apostles [!!] but thinking women, will I hope, sit and talk to each other, relate to the women weavers of carpets from the Atlas mountains, with whom Fatema is writing a book called – “**The Flying Berber Carpet Enigma**”. They will be our tethering in reality.

We will see if all the experience we have, - lived, scholarly, learnt from the ground; and all the desires we have to create a more hospitable space for the less privileged, or deprived, of our locations, can lead to some ideas and related strategies. It is a quest ...

I have hope, and some confidence that we can get to identify the first steps, a frame work, a core bundle of items, a push towards that goal in the two and a half days that we will have. I say this because, nearly 20 years ago, a similar amongst, namely that the rhetoric and the programmes and the frameworks- which had been developed after the Mexico Conference in 1975,- were not only, not relieving the pressure on poor women, but were exacerbating it, - led me to do a review paper which I called “*Development as if women Mattered, Can women build a new paradigm?*”³. I circulated it to friends with whom I had made the journey between 1975 and 1983, and invited them to a meeting, in Bangalore in 1984, which later led to the designing or creating of a different framework, than the one that the UN was using for the Nairobi conference, shifting dramatically the WID approach, and the founding of the now well known DAWN network and book.

At that Bangalore meeting, it would not surprise you to know, that it was Fatema Mernissi, who with one impatient stroke, moved us away from nibbling, and fumbling at the fringes of the given UN and WID framework, to looking at regional macro crises. It is that intervention, done with Fatema’s well known

² *Faye Harrison’s theme for the next ie 2007 meeting of the AAA American association of anthropologists . “Difference, (In)equality, & Justice.”

³ Devaki Jain, “*Development as if Women Mattered*” or “*Can Women Build a New Paradigm?*” Lecture at OEDC/DAC Meeting, Paris, January, 1983.

impatience with conventional reasoning, which led to the DAWN book; flagging the macro economic situation as the location for analyzing poor womens situation, and opportunities or impediments. It is my hope that this same miracle will happen here, in the atmosphere created by Fatema and her presence, to find that flash of imagination and inspiration that will take us away from the given to something new and useful .

I would reveal here that **my basic interest** is in enabling women in poverty to walk out of it, or not to be trapped into it.

II

What got me started are

1. Women's gyana.:

My book, Women, Development and the UN , A Sixty Year quest for Equality and justice 2005⁴ which has been sent to all of you , was one of the triggers that made me undertake this journey of calling such a meeting . It seemed women were challenging given Knowledge and providing new knowledge, apart from ways of constructing knowledge, their **gyana**.

In the provisioning of new knowledge, which basically meant not only undermining the existing knowledge, but also introducing new ideas for the very methodology of construction of knowledge; for the legitimacy of the construction and propagation of the "great design": "the single solution". This knowledge journey became in my opinion, both - self empowering, and the major tool for influencing "the other" through the political campaigns of the women's movement for establishing that complex goal of "equal but different."

They undermined every aspect of what I would call the "existent knowledge" which includes measures, the methods, the fact base, the construct of development theories, the composition of laws, international conventions, spaces in the global arena. Therefore it was not only that women were making themselves visible in both statistics and in choices but they were actually reconstructing, recasting, and undermining the very elements of the mainstream development discourse.

Looking back, I think, the most important contribution that research by women on women, even what can be called the articulation of the lived experience of

⁴ Devaki Jain, Women, Development and the UN – A Sixty-Year Quest for Equality and Justice, UNIHP, IUP, Bloomington, USA, 2005

women,- both personal as well as revealed- is the contribution that has been made to **knowledge**.

Helen Longino in her reflections on "Feminist Standpoint Theory and the Problems of Knowledge."⁵

"The problems of knowledge are central to feminist theorizing, which has sought to destabilize andocentric, mainstream thinking in the humanities and in the social and natural sciences. "

The introduction of a gendered reconstruction of the various components, or subjects, or themes of the broader subject of development, or transformation. This effort not only drew attention to conceptions of "difference," and the role of patriarchy and the implications of these for practice and policymaking in all the fields of inquiry, but the gendered analysis also challenged the very basis of knowledge construction. It transformed the facts, the study, the construction of development theories, and thereby the policies and practices that followed. The definition of categories, the tools of measurement and the interpretation and analysis of the data collected were all transformed. Seemingly straight forward elements such as "work," "the household," and "the poor"; measuring tools such as money, the domestic product, and calorie requirements for types of work; the hierarchies in valuation, from the contribution to the economic, social and political spaces to the intellectual spaces, were not only challenged but replaced by the uncovering of the difference revealed by gender.

A disturbing aspect of this evolution, was that most of this new knowledge, was provided by women—it did not attract the participation of both sexes, as normally scholarship or approaches defined by difference do. Class or race based analysis, and perspectives, for example, are a subject of study and discussion not only by those who belong to that race or that class, but also by "others" too.

Yet, as an analytical tool, gendering has a revelatory quality. For instance, the phenomenon of inequality, and discrimination, which occupies center stage in all areas of governance or the social sciences, when seen through a gendered lens, enlarges the phenomena, revealing not only its many occurrences and dimensions, but also the many dilemmas in overcoming its existence. For example all other categories of unequal positions, have in them embedded, gender based inequality: within class, race, caste, minorities, indigenusness, refugees, age, occupational, work, power layers/ladders. Gender inequality is also found in locational classifications, such as family and institutions, in access

⁵ Helen E Longino, "Feminist Standpoint Theory and the Problems of Knowledge." *Signs*. Autumn 1993, Volume 19 No. 1, pp 201-212

to and absorption of services, such as food, health, education, et cetera. There exists a multi-dimensional inequality and exercise of discrimination.

Amartya Sen (2001) captures this phenomenon well when he says:

“The afflicted world in which we live is characterised by deeply unequal sharing of the burden of adversities between women and men. Gender inequality exists in most parts of the world, from *Japan to Morocco*, [*italics mine*] from Uzbekistan to the United States of America. However, inequality between women and men can take very many different forms. Indeed, gender inequality is not one homogeneous phenomenon, but a collection of disparate and interlinked problems. And within each community, nationality and class, the burden of hardship often falls disproportionately on women.⁶”

Viewpoints emerging out of gendered experiences revealed the existence of *other economies, other political spaces, other social relations and behaviors, other values and other measures of value* (Henderson, 1996).⁷ For example the unpaid economy, the politics within the closed doors of the household, including the discrimination in provision of basic amenities, apart from power; women’s collective actions both economic, social and political expressed covertly and overtly revealing choices which are different from the choices of their “own” men (Jain, 1993).⁸ The shift to social indicators, to human development, to reclassifying spaces such as home as not a sheltered private place but also open to judicial intervention. All this “breaking out” of unique descriptions of the polity were outcomes of this inquiry.

To illustrate: The exposing of the fault line embedded in the definitions, codes, classifications and valuations related to women and work opened the doors of perception to different modes of work, different sources of contributions to value, not only based on gender but on geographical location, citizenship status, nature of political economy and culture. Unpaid work, social capital, The Care Economy⁹, Beyond Economics¹⁰, the recognition that there were other than

⁶ Amartya Sen, 'Many Faces of Gender Inequality.' *An inaugural lecture at the New Radcliffe Institute at Harvard University* 24 April 2001

⁷ Hazel Henderson, [Creating Alternative Futures: The End of Economics](#) Kumarian Press Books for a World That Works Connecticut 1996

⁸ Devaki Jain The Leadership Gap: Challenge to Feminists, Presidential Address, Indian Association of Women's Studies Conference, Mysore, 1993. Devaki Jain, Development as if Women Mattered - Can Women Build a new Paradigm? OECD, Paris, 1983.

⁹ Care Work – The quest for security, Edited by Mary Daly, International Labour Organisation, 2001.

¹⁰ Hazel Henderson, *ibid* 1996

the industrial-revolutionized economic typologies—emerged out of the introduction of “new” knowledge coming from feminist research / analysis / life experience. The broadening of the concept of gainful activity, the crafting of tools for enumerating and identifying the worker, the renaming of locations (home is work place), to upturning the hierarchies in language, location, perception, indicators, theoretical propositions released immense knowledge, followed by advocacy, that led to more appropriate policy responses and many other transformations (Beneria, 1997).¹¹

Another illustration: Household was the ultimate unit of classification not only for data collection but also for programmatic responses, especially related to poverty. Such as the counting of poverty numbers, providing of employment, the provisioning of services such as credit, or food and so on. Studies opened this box and found that women and children not only had different bread earning activities, but also differences in access to services be it health or education or time or leisure. Further the households amongst the poor may not be homogenous bonded individuals collectively optimizing their household operations. They are often fragmented, separated, and within them many are headed by women, who fend for themselves and the family’s survival (Jain 2001)¹². Within poverty households, especially assetless laborer’s households women had higher labor force participation rates than men as they were willing to accept harsh, badly, paid work for the sake of family survival. (Jain 1996, ISST 1979; Jain and Banerjee 1979).¹³

This differentiating along gender lines within households in poverty, basically individualizing its members, changed the collection of statistics, the employment offers, the understanding of employment trends, the efforts to unionize labor, the nature of credit offers including the need for collateral. The nature of women’s work often within the household, often as self-employed traders drew attention to what is now known as the informal sector, (Carr and Chen, 2002)¹⁴ and to the importance of this sector in the economy. Concepts like household level food security were changed to individual food security within the household as sequential feeding in several cultures (Ann Whitehead), meant

¹¹ Lourdes Beneria Accounting for Women's Work in the Women Gender and Development Reader, Zed books 1997

¹² Devaki Jain, ‘Through the Looking Glass of Poverty’, Lecture, New Hall College, University of Cambridge, 19 October, 2001

¹³ Devaki Jain, *Valuing Work: Time as a Measure*. Economic and Political Weekly, Vol. XXXI, No. 43, October 26 1996, and Institute of Social Studies Trust, “Impact on Women Workers - Maharashtra Employment Guarantee Scheme,” a study sponsored by ILO, Geneva, December 1979 (Mimeo) Tyranny of the Household, ed Devaki Jain and Nirmala Banerjee, VIKAS 1979

¹⁴ Marilyn Carr and Marty Chen Globalization and the Informal Economy: How Global Trade and Investment Impact on the Working Poor, International Labour Organisation 2002

that children especially female children and adults had smaller shares of household food and health services etc in some places (FAO World Food Conference). This attention to intra-household inequality in all aspects - power, earnings, service utilization, work and time load, leisure, morbidity and mortality rates - led to many transformations in the approach to “development and freedom,” to borrow from Sen.

For example *the importance of individual rights*, and its impact on the perception of the family as an arena which is not “fair” in its dealings with its members, matched the universality of human rights approach. Women’s situation revealed the importance of such universalization. The importance of social inputs, social security as a public good to even out the inequality embedded in the power structure. The fact that economic achievement measured in conventional terms, hides the achievements in social protection and that the two often do not go together led to the attention to social development, going on to human development and its deviation from standard economic growth¹⁵

III

The dilemmas and problematique

I think however there are problematiques here: the problematique of identity I call it . . . *to be or not to be ?* and the problematique of theorizing because we reject “theory”, the one size fits all ideas .

1. The problematique of identity

My argument is that despite great leaps in uncovering of knowledge, as well as extraordinarily skillful strategizing, neither has the value of women’s advisories to public policy been recognized; nor have the tools been adequate to achieve that recognition. My further argument is that there are in built difficulties, problematiques, in getting the inclusion of women in public policy right, which I attempt to capture in the title *to be or not to be*. This is the ancient and well traversed, and relevant to many other social groupings question: *separate or “integrated”*, also known as the difference and equal debate.

On the grounds that centuries of exclusion, of deep unbridgeable differences, have to be overcome it is often argued that the identity tag, has its

¹⁵ Devaki Jain, *Valuing Work: Time as a Measure*, Economic and Political Weekly, Vol. XXXI, No. 43, October 26 1996, and Institute of Social Studies Trust, “Impact on Women Workers - Maharashtra Employment Guarantee Scheme,” a study sponsored by ILO, Geneva, December 1979 (Mimeo)

strategic value and is a necessary tool for negotiation of justice. But the identity 'tag' may not be "valid" as there are multiple identities with their embedded hierarchies within an identity tag, like women or even dalit or black. There is enough material on these debates from the racism¹⁶ as well as dalit discourse.¹⁷

I often refer to the well-known Indian argument between Gandhiji and Ambedkar¹⁸ to illustrate the problematique of the separate vs integrate dilemmas. One of the most notable and still contentious issues in India in the field of social justice, is the debate on how to enable the castes who had been historically excluded and oppressed to level up, and overcome this historical blemish. Prior to drafting the constitution of free India in 1946-47, Dr. Ambedkar, demanded reservation, special provisions, ladders to "uplift" them from their neglected positions. Gandhi, argued that by thus doing, these castes would be marked, their identity made explicit, and therefore they would always be "separated", even continue to receive the demeaning gaze that they have historically received. and be impeded in being absorbed into the body politic, into social spaces as equals. To Gandhi integration meant muting of difference, and appeal to the moral sense of human beings to overcome their discriminatory mindsets. Dr Ambedkar, reasoned that this was an impractical hope and special provisions are crucial for compensating for historically embedded and experienced in Justice.

The old debate still haunts this "difference " and has also led to ideas of "reservation " for women, and such legal, as opposed to moral mechanisms, to compensate for such practices of exclusion and subordination. The debate however rages on whether such provisions have reduced or exacerbated the inequalities, whether they have not been scarred by the 'creamy layer' within the 'excluded' and so on.

Emphasizing the separate identity, such as women or dalit, also invites among other items exclusion, perpetuates it. The room of ones own, to take the metaphor from Virginia Woolf¹⁹ does give the space for self strength. But it can also become the ghetto.

¹⁶ Faye V. Harrison, *Facing Racism and the Moral Responsibility of Human Rights Knowledge*, New York; Academy of Sciences (Reprinted from *Ethics and Anthropology*, Volume 925 of the *Annals of the New York, Academy of Sciences*, December 2000

¹⁷ Devaki Jain, 'Gender inequity as racism', *The Hindu*, 23 September 2000

¹⁸ Bipin Chandra, Mridula Mukherjee, Aditya Mukherjee, KN Pannikar, Sucheta Mahajan, "Indias's Struggle For Independence," Penguin Books, 1988

¹⁹ Virginia Woolf, *A Room of One's Own*_(Granada, 1977 Published: 1929)

Fatema Mernissi in her paper for this meeting has given a new dimension to the discussions on Identity, - which I hope will move us into larger imaginations .

2. The problematique of theorizing:

The history of women's encounters with "mainstream" knowledge reveals both distance and neglect. In reviewing for example, the history of economic thought there is a glaring mismatch between men and women in the method and ethic of the construction of knowledge and theory and therefore a glaring absence of the female in these historical tracings. Thus when we teach the history of economic thought, for example in India, we have a rubric which says from Adam Smith, through Ricardo, Marx, Marshall, Keynes and then of course we come to the models Harrod Domar and so on.²⁰ We do not see any females here nor would we, due to the feminist view, namely the feminist rejection of a single dominant analysis or idea or construct.²¹

Feminists insist that it is the experiential as well as the collective that births an idea, and further that there can be no one box, one theoretical construct that can be claimed to either reflect or be applied to all situations. The unfolding of new knowledge, that feminist discourse has provided for example the unpeeling of the several layers and prismatic appearances, and knots, that surround the notion of equality, challenges the notion of dogma.

The feminist agenda raises questions on what constitutes knowledge and how the disciplinary divisions are created. This questioning creates a "politics of disturbance"²². It unsettles the given and starts to "plough up inherited turfs without planting the same old seeds in the field."²³ Bringing 'women in' means that the fields of study have to change in multiple ways. The change includes

²⁰ Richard Jolly, Louis Emmerij, Dharam Ghai and Frederic Lapeyre, "UN Contributions to Development Thinking and Practice", (Bloomington, Indiana University Press, 2004)

²¹ Jane L. Parpart, M. Patricia Connelly and V. Eudine Barriteau, "Theoretical Perspectives on Gender and Development", (Canada, International Development Research Centre, 2000); Devaki Jain, "Development Theory and Practice - Insights emerging from Women's Experience", (Economic and Political Weekly, July 7, 1990, Mumbai,) pp 1445-54

²² William Connolly "Democracy and Territory" in M Ringrose and A.J. Lerner (eds) reimagining the nation (Open University Press 1993) 61

²³ Christine Sylvester, (1998), "Homeless in International Relations? "Women's" Place in Canonical Texts and in Feminist Reimaginings," in Anne Phillips, ed., *Feminism and Politics* (Oxford: Oxford University Press):44-66

unpacking of assumptions. It leads to a realization of how central these assumptions are for the way any discipline is organized.

“The limits of epistemology as they have been illuminated by feminists with their transgressive moves are marked by the use of politics: *situated* transversal politics of knowledge, that challenge disembodied “generalising” theories typical of epistemological accounts. I take as a figure of this politics the idea of “situated knowledges.”

“My preference [is] to speak of “knowledge politics” instead of “epistemology” to refer to histories told about feminist interventions on knowledge and science...” says Maria Puig de la Bellacasa.²⁴

Neti nethi Another less discussed aspect of the invisibility of women’s theorizing or even of women theorizing is what I would like to call the *nethi nethi*, syndrome. In the Upanishads, ancient Indian philosophical discourse, the quest for “the truth”, is to reject every suggestion that is made for defining it, by the words “not this”, “not this”. In other words, it is definition by negation. Often I feel that feminists deny every attempt at a definition or a formulation or an arrival at a conclusive statement or standpoint. It is extremely difficult to unravel gendered spaces, gendered knowledge and gendered concepts. The problematique is embedded in the very nature of the problem of women’s location in every space, and her capacity to question.

A K Sen, who has a whole book²⁵ to argue against single identities, has not addressed this complexity arising out of women’s engagement with identity, which has a characteristic which would have enriched his discussions.

Celebration of diversity, pluralism, affirming of identity based on color, caste, class gender, as well as multiple identities and analyzing the intersections as well as the distances is current currency. It seems to reflect the pressure for representation, for democracy; - but it also could be the outcome of the increase in disparities, based on color, class, religion, caste, gender and location. Disparities, especially if coupled with deprivation, generate a search for ladders to climb out, and building solidarity on ethnic, religious and such identities, and using them for political articulation and power has been one chosen route. This trend has invaded the women’s movement, and in parallel the governmental positions – thus making building consensus more difficult.

²⁴ Feminist knowledge politics in situated zones A different hi/story of knowledge construction
Maria Puig de la Bellacasa

²⁵ Amartya Sen, ‘Identity and Violence: The Illusion of Destiny’, (Penguin Books, New Delhi, 2006)

Fragmentation of identity based on sex, has also led to some slight withdrawal within the UN of emphasizing gender, as a superseding identity over race, class and other stratifications. This trend has also room for expressions of cultural relativism – an unwelcome idea.

A major fault line that runs through histories of knowledge as a whole, is the failure to take note of, to understand and respect and to absorb, women's ideational and intellectual skills and outputs in the area of theoretical and analytical knowledge. While some of the values emerging from the understanding of poverty, inequality, discrimination, conflict resolution, deepening participation, method, that this interaction or intersection generated, has been applied or followed on belatedly, recognition of the intellectual and leadership powers of women has remained in the ghettos. The minds of men have not changed.

Amina Mama's words, part of a speech at the Uganda World Congress on Women, 2002 captures, this aspect of "Missing Women" - A. K. Sen's²⁶ concept.

"Even our most radical political scientists have failed when it comes to addressing the intellectual and political challenge posed by the problematic nature of gendered identity. Postcolonial feminist theory has a great deal to teach our leading lights in contemporary political analysis. The complicated phenomena currently being grouped under the rubric of 'identity politics', for example, have not been adequately theorised, and ignores all the feminist theory on the gendered nature of identity. Yet it has been clear since the days of Freud that all identities are gendered, whether one is talking about identity at the level of individuality, sociality or politics. Feminist theory also has much to contribute to our understanding of statecraft and politics. At the very least it alerts us to the partial and limited manifestations of individuality, sociality and politics in patriarchal societies. It leads us to ask interesting questions, such as whether there is a link between male domination of social and political life and the prevalence of war and militarism?"

Within the conceptualization of inequality and discrimination, or probing what can be called the gender knot, or unraveling the gender knot,²⁷ lies the core issue, namely valuation of women as a sub set of all social stratifications. Women's roles, allocations determined not only by biology, but the interpretation of the biological role, its entanglement, with culture and tradition,

²⁶ Amartya Sen, "More than 100 million women are missing, New York Review of Books, Vol 37, No. 20, December 20, 1990 (<http://ucatlans.ucsc.edu/gender/sen/00m.html>)

²⁷ Allan G Johnson, "The Gender Knot", (Philadelphia, Temple University Press, 1997)

including religion have been assigned values which have impeded the building of leveled playing fields.

The story of women's reasoning is a story of unpeeling the layers in which this inequality is embedded and the many faces of difference that need to be addressed, strategies to be employed and structures from local to global that are needed for removing this inequality. It outlines the legal, political, social, cultural, economic, and ethical elements that come into play in the quest for equality. It points to the enemies of the idea as indeed Mill pointed to where the threats to liberty come from.

Almost all the diverse themes, events, debates that have engaged the women's movement over the 50-55 years can be captured in just the one issue, or notion or concept or aspiration - equality. Women's quest provides a rich exposition of the kaleidoscopic complex, multi dimensional "thought", termed equality. The many faces of inequality, the intertwined aspect, its "universality" as well as its "particularity" were exposed. Legal attempts, struggle attempts, deep plumbing into philosophy and politics, economics and sociology, culture, action took place, enriching the topic, even if not necessarily achieving the objective. However, the quest also seems to suggest that while unraveling and enriching this thought -it is difficult to actually achieve the outcome - a willow the wisp that escaped the attempts to capture.

But the exposition itself is worth the journey, as it also provided the torch light for other inequalities and attempts to redress them. There is value added both in the re-conceptualization as well as the fact that there is a tangible awareness worldwide, even in the most remote so called illiterate spaces, that there is an issue of injustice, which needs to be redressed. Affirmative action has been accepted, as is inclusion, as crucial for justice.

Making the invisible visible, peeling the layers of the onion seemed to be the process, and it is in this process that the "other" domains gained. In other words revealing of the excluded or the invisible was a method, a process that also revealed other invisible facts or phenomena, and enabled new dimensions and new lights to be thrown on old or dark spots This broader enlightenment is where the knowledge flew into the modernization theories, challenging them deconstructing and reconstructing them apart from obstructing them.²⁸

²⁸ Devaki Jain, Women's Participation in the History of Ideas: The Importance of Reconstructing Knowledge, paper presented at National Institute for Advanced Studies, Bangalore, 6 February 2004; Hazel Henderson, *Paradigms in Progress – Life Beyond Economics*, (Indianapolis: Knowledge Systems, Inc., 1991); Marilyn Waring, "If Women Counted: A New Feminist Economics", _(San Francisco: Harper & Row) (First published in New Zealand as Counting for Nothing: What Men Value and What Women are Worth. Wellington: Allen & Unwin.), 1988

Ann Tickner²⁹ has suggested that there has been evolution from ideology/theory through institutionalism, to pragmatism, and in between liberal and other ideas moving through several other settings - post modernism and post of that; coming back not only to the inclusion of science and technology, communications, as elements that have to be incorporated into development theorizing, or paradigms but going beyond to invoke philosophy, ethics and culture

Feminist evolution, she suggests has run parallel to this evolution, - flagging method, process – breaking out of economic categories but also arguing against theory itself against the idea of rules and the logic of a theory, or taking on structure to dismantle through counter facts. *There is now a shift from paradigms to discourse*, an open forum unable to close due to the recognition of the multiplicity of factors that determine change. Intellectualism has moved from logic to discourse.

Analyzing the foundations of modern scientific knowledge construction, feminist philosopher Sandra Harding claims that traditional social science has typically asked questions about nature and social life that certain (usually privileged) men want answered³⁰. Harding traces the relationship between the development of modern western science and the history of European expansion. Challenging the claim to value-neutrality of modern science with respect to the questions it has asked, she argues that European voyages of discovery went hand in hand with the development of modern science and technology – Europeans who were colonizing the world needed to know about winds, tides, maps and navigation as well as botany, the construction of ships, firearms, and survival in harsh environments. Such questions became intellectually interesting in order to solve colonialism’s everyday problems³¹.

Ann Tinckner³² says “Feminists in all the disciplines have been acutely aware of the relationship between knowledge and power and the ways that traditional knowledge has been constructed in the interests of the powerful. Feminist scholarship has emerged from a deep skepticism about knowledge which, while it claims to be universal and objective, is not. In reality, such knowledge is usually partial, created by men and based on men’s lives. Sensitive to gendered differences in these regards, feminists see their scholarly

²⁹ Ann J Tickner, “*Gender in International Relations: Feminist Perspectives on Achieving Global Security*”, (Columbia University Press October, 1993)

³⁰ Sandra Harding, ed., *Feminism and Methodology*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1987, pg 6

³¹ Sandra Harding, *Is Science Multicultural? Postcolonialism, Feminisms, and Epistemologies*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1998, pgs 39-54

³² . Ann Tickner, *On the Frontlines or Sidelines of Knowledge and Power? Feminist Practices of Responsible Scholarship*, Presidential address prepared for delivery at the 2006 Annual Meeting of the International Studies Association, San Diego, California, March 23, 2006]

responsibility as creating new knowledge that is less androcentric, more genuinely universal, and that produces research that is useful to women. “

It was in this quest to replace the existent that women across conventional divides found unity; they were on the same wavelength in critiquing ideas such as the dichotomies of development and rights, public and private, theory and practice, women's rights and human rights, home and workplace. They found that they could create alliances under **the umbrella of thought**, as the common space

Women's studies have been a critical actor in the journey. Learning about women came from two sources: the collective voice of those working in communities and those challenging the academy. Knowledge was created and disseminated through a multiple set of sources. One was research that documented grassroots success stories; another was research that provided a more-sophisticated analysis of women's location in the world.

I argue that it is this very difference from men, in the area of thought, in **knowing**, that has inhibited the adoption, accommodation of women's views into the policy spaces, but also inhibited women from participating in those spaces.

However this very characteristic of difference between men and women in what is thought and what is knowledge, - truth, and the disagreement with the idea of the final word, has generated a self created alienation from the big world of MIND³³ What seems to suggest itself then is to think how to use the knowledge and self-strength, Knowing, gyana that has been garnered by feminist reasoning to really move forward to affirm its power

SUCH REJECTION AND QUESTIONING IS RESONATED BY FEMINISTS IN OTHER LOCATIONS. E.G.

“...we women are in no position to deprive ourselves of the intellectual tools that can assist us in pursuit of gender justice. The arena of the intellect has been used to suppress us. We cannot afford to ignore the importance of intellectual work, especially in the 21st century when knowledge and information define power more than ever before”, Amina Mama.³⁴

³³ Yasuko Muramatsu, “Gender and Economics in Japan -Japanese Women's Position in Economics and Activities of Japan Association for Feminist Economics to Advance Gender Perspective”, paper presented at Sixth Science Council of Workshop: A Comparative Study of the Research Conditions of Women Scientists and the Present States of Women's/Gender Studies in Asian Countries Towards the Human Centered Sustainable Development, New Delhi, April 17, 2006,

³⁴ Excerpt from interview of Elaine Salo with Amina Mama, (African Feminisms I, no.50 (2001), 58-63 (http://www.world.org/programs/regions/africa/amina_mama.htm))

Bisi Bakare-Ysuf in *Feminist Africa* says:

“What is needed is a genealogical investigation into the relations of power, representational regimes, and religious, political and philosophical structures that shape the discourses and experiences of maternity and paternity in Africa, both in the present and in the past. Such a project need not deny that maternity and birth could provide an ontological framework for thinking through women’s identities beyond patriarchal domination. However, the envisaging of liberating identities for women must be based on a thorough and critical analysis of institutional frameworks and social relationships that constrain and prescribe women’s actions and social freedoms. Existential phenomenology offers a valuable methodology because it does not assume a metaphysical framework within which all subsequent operations must take place avoiding the assumption of a subject and an object phenomenon is simply “that which appears”.

“Definitions belonged to the definers – not the defined”. Toni Morrison³⁵

“The role of the intellectual is to say truth to power, to address the central authority in every society without hypocrisy, and to choose the method, the style, the critique best suited for these purposes. This is so because the intellectual produces a kind of performance that continues for years, whose main goal is to give utterance not to mere fashion and passing fads but to real ideas and values”- Edward Said³⁶

IV

The Contradictory trajectories – women visible but “invisible”

1. **The second trigger or stimulus** for this meeting, also emerging out of my review of development history for my book , was the wide spread recognition that over the past especially two decades, two trajectories relative to women and development , indicating oppositional trends had emerged. The first trajectory is the emergence of a strong political presence in the national and international scene of the women's movement. There is now a widespread consciousness of the necessity of engaging in gendered analysis that recognizes both difference and inequality and its implications for development design.

³⁵ Toni Morrison, *Beloved*, quoted in Eisenstein (2004: 188)

³⁶ Said (1996:184-85)

The second trajectory reveals that the situation on the ground for many women, especially those living in poverty and in conflict-ridden situations, seems to have worsened, despite the fact that it has been addressed specifically by both the State and development thought.

The harsh and unequal impact of poverty on women and men is affirmed in many sources, some of which I refer to below.

UNIFEM's Progress of the World's Women report for 2000 noted that although many obstacles to women's employment had crumbled, women in Sub-Saharan Africa and Eastern Europe faced deteriorating economic conditions; many lived in nations facing increased indebtedness, which is often correlated with lower rates of schooling for girls; and household income inequality increased across a wide range of countries in both developed and developing nations. These trends suggest that "poor women have not enjoyed much of the fruits of any progress."³⁷

The Department of Economic and Social Affairs' World's Women 2000 noted higher rates of unemployment for women than for men and a higher proportion of women than men in the informal economy. The report found that women spend more time doing unpaid work and less time earning money for their labor than men. It suggested that "assets controlled by women have a more positive and significant effect on expenditures for children, such as education and clothing, than those controlled by men."³⁸

UNESCO's 2000 World Culture Report emphasized inequality of access to resources, political power, information, and the media. Such inequalities impact people's capacity to make choices, which is the true capability to exercise rights. The report underscores the fact that women often experience unequal access because of barriers linked to or attributed to cultural practices.³⁹

An FAO review concluded that rural women are primary victims of hunger and poverty despite the fact that they are crucial partners in combating these problems and achieving global food security. It concluded that "the most disadvantaged population in the world today comprises rural women in developing countries, who have been the last to benefit--or [are] negatively affected by--prevailing economic growth and development processes. Gender

³⁷ UNIFEM, *Progress of the World's Women 2000*, 11.

³⁸ UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs, *World's Women 2000*, 118, 122, 125.

³⁹ UNESCO Culture Sector, *World Culture Report: Cultural Diversity, Conflict, and Pluralism* (Paris: UNESCO Publishing, 2000).

bias and blindness persist; farmers are still generally perceived as 'male' by policy-makers, development planners and agricultural service deliverers."⁴⁰

But perhaps the most important survey on the topic of women and development during this period was the Division for the Advancement of Women's 1999 World Survey on the Role of Women in Development. It focused on the most urgent issues of the day: globalization, gender, and work. In contrast to much of development policy of this time, the survey focused on the central issue of employment. This was a position women in developing countries supported. The survey focused on the changing nature of the labor markets and the feminization of labor, providing support to UN constituencies such as the ILO that were trying to understand ways to circumvent the harmful effects of globalization. Its strongest contribution, however, is the endorsement it gave to the findings of feminist economists around the world that macroeconomics is not gender neutral and has gender-asymmetric effects. Its recommendations advanced from a general concern for engendering macroeconomics to specific interventions in the design of international measures regarding trade policy and core labor standards. It recommends the stabilization of capital flows and coordination of global economic demand as measures to protect and enhance the value of women's labor.⁴¹

In the years 2000 to 2005, there have been many collective reflections by varied configurations of the worldwide women's movement about what went wrong. These include meetings hosted by AWID and DAWN and the regional conferences of AAWORD. Reflections emerged at the Conference of NGOs (CONGO) at Beijing +5 at the UN in New York. The conference noted the stark contrast between eventful and "successful" UN conferences on women, on the one hand, and the grim picture of the situation of women and children in many parts of the world, on the other. The conversations that took place at this conference led to other gatherings dedicated to this issue.

For example at the Beijing +10 UN event in New York in 2005, a noticeable feature was the almost unified concern about not only the unipolarity of global power, but its viciousness, its conservatism, its overarching indifference to economic and social justice. There was a tangible unity in this regard across the boundaries of government non-government and also within the UN

40 "FAO Plan of Action for Women in Development," available online at <http://www.fao.org/waicent/faoinfo/sustdev/WPdirect/WPre0001.htm#topofpage>. This Plan was a product of the twenty-eighth FAO conference in the fall of 1995.

⁴¹ *1999 World Survey on the Role of Women in Development*, 29<N>30.

The conference discussed the employment consequences of trade led growth accompanied by enthusiastic regional economic cooperation in the South countries. While understanding that these clubs are to bring to the South economic strength, almost as a counter to North economic clubs, particularly the EU and the G8 and the configurations at the WTO, they had some particular distresses for women: On the one hand they had a greater demand for female labour than male, but on the other the working conditions and wage securities were dreadful. A representative of the World Bank was audacious enough to state that the Chinese one child norm, whereby females had been killed, had now presented a problem to the fast growing Chinese economy which needed female labour.⁴²

It was also pointed out that “reform” a euphemism for Structural Adjustment Programs, and Liberalisation Privatisations Globalisation had moved the Chinese economy from formal to informal – in the sense that now wages were not regularly paid to the employees of the small work shops where production was put out by the multi nationals; and there was no legal framework for the workers to claim their wage. Informalisation of contracts, of the whole system of production and trade had made workers acutely vulnerable.⁴³

Shifting the Risk: the key words, used by Lourdes Beneria⁴⁴ - from the rich to the poor, from the corporate to the home, from the state to the corporate , from social cohesion to social conflict, miniaturizing identities, as Amartya Sen says in his book “⁴⁵

A vivid presence at the 2005 CSW celebration of fifty years conference was the Nobel Laureate Wangari Matthai: accessible, modest, clear headed and beautiful – who called attention to the links between her grass root movement, the planting of trees, as calling attention to the need to be more involved in the conservation of natural resources. She went further to point out that it is unequal access to natural resources along with the depletion of natural resources that was

⁴² Jayati Ghosh, “Integration of Gender Perspective in Macroeconomics”, New York, 2005; Marco Ferroni, “Integration of Gender Perspective in Macroeconomics”, New York, 2005; Yassine Fall, “Integration of Gender Perspective in Macroeconomics”, New York, 2005; Danny Leipziger, “Integration of Gender Perspective in Macroeconomics”, New York, 2005; Nenadi E. Usman, “Integration of Gender Perspective in Macroeconomics”, New York, 2005.

⁴³ UNRISD Gender Equality Striving for Justice in an Unequal World, 2005

⁴⁴ **Shifting the Risk: New Employment Patterns, Informalization, and Women's Work** Lourdes Beneria, International Journal of Politics, Culture, and Society, Issue Volume 15, Number 1 / September, 2001

⁴⁵ *Amartya Sen, 'Identity and Violence: The Illusion of Destiny', (Penguin Books, New Delhi, 2006)*

basically the cause of the little and the big wars. **In other words, she made the link between peace and natural resources.**

The third link she made was between the availability of natural resources and women's basic needs, i.e. the items that were crucial in women's domain, however stereotyped that domain might be. Thus the shortage of water directly added to women's burden and it was shortage of water that was coming up due to both, the removal of trees, and the careless exploitation of natural resources, to which injuries added the injury of privatization of scarce resources like water.

In drawing attention to conflict, she went quite deep and broad in saying that even the Iraq war, amongst others, like the local wars in Congo and Angola were all for the sake of access and domination over natural resources. Therefore by attending to natural resources from local to global, we were actually fulfilling the vision of women, namely for a peaceful world.⁴⁶

Finally in a subtle way, Wangari related the parable of the humming bird. Once upon there was a very large bush fire in a forest and all the animals fled except a humming bird which picked up just drops of water from a river and put it on the fire. When ridiculed by the rest of the animals she said, I am doing what I can do. Wangari smiled – and said 'and may be if we do what we can do, we can even put out the Bush fire!'

The latest HDR 2006, *Beyond scarcity: "Power, poverty and the global water crisis"*⁴⁷ says-"In the early 21st Century, prospects for human development are threatened by a deepening global water crisis. Debunking the myth that the crisis is the result of scarcity, this report argues **poverty, power and inequality** are at the heart of the problem. Beyond the household, competition for water as a productive resource is intensifying. Symptoms of that competition include the collapse of water-based ecological systems, declining river flows and large-scale groundwater depletion. Conflicts over water are intensifying within countries, **with the rural poor losing out**. The potential for tensions between countries is also growing, though there are large potential human development gains from increased cooperation

Attending UN conferences , B+5, +10 as well as other gatherings such as AWID or WIDE or ESCAP or innumerable review meetings in India and in South Asia , across disciplines , revealed not only this disjunction, but the difficulties or failures in bridging that divide, in finding a way to make use of

⁴⁶ www.wangarimaathai.com

⁴⁷ Human Development Report 2006, *"Beyond scarcity: Power, poverty and the global water crisis"*, Published for UNDP, New York, 2006

the arrival in global and local spaces, to heal the wounds , to prevent the victimization. The built in difficulties of consolidating identity ,and other problematiques, nullified our power . That we were ignored or could not effect transformation , influence the powerscapes , was a fault line within ourselves

V

Some Illustrations from India

Let me take you to India as many of us find it right now , to illustrate my view points.

India is right now boiling with conflict and its violent expression. It has not attracted the media attention of say CNN or BBC, -the windows from which we internationalists get our knowledge, alas – as much as Iraq and now Iran India is seen by world media and world high profile reports as this burgeoning economy, like China, growing at rates as high as 8 and 9% growth of GDP. Her Savings rate, her Foreign Exchange Balances, her attractiveness to Foreign Direct Investment, all indicators of a healthy promising economy are all very “healthy” But to us living in India, the other side of this face of India is full of portent .

Now the State wishes to open retail trade to foreign direct investment [FDI]⁴⁸. It is my view that if we open it to FDI, the WALMART syndrome will exterminate us. It is a monster and is eating up other small monsters like K Mart in America. The monster admits this, and I quote from the journal of the retail trade consortium:

“India is the hottest retail spot ...India’s retail industry both food and non food is the second largest employer, after agriculture, and the second largest *untapped* (emphasis mine) market.... Retail market worth 330 billion dollars... As grand ambitions materialize, (i.e. the entry of global players) the retail space will become increasingly concentrated, *as smaller players are forced out or bought up by larger companies* and the new companies change the face of the market ... capture non food spending etc”⁴⁹

⁴⁸ Elissa Braunstein, ‘Foreign Direct Investment, Development and Gender Equity: A Review of Research and Policy’, Occasional Paper 12, United Nations Research Institute for Social Development, January 2006

⁴⁹ AT Kearney’s, ‘2005 Global Retail Development Index, an annual study of retail investment’, The Financial Express, 9 July 2005

This is further, unselfconsciously stated by Bush, during his recent March 2006 visit to India. Trying to soothe the unhappiness of U S citizens about the loss of US job slots to India, he said this will be overwhelmingly compensated by the market for US products, in India. "We just have to find out what Indian's want, and then produce it, and then we have million consumers buying it! It is a great and expanding market for US". He said and I quote:

"We see those opportunities here in India. Americans who come to this country will see Indian consumers buying McCurry Meals from McDonald's, home appliances from Whirlpool. They will see Indian businesses buying American products like the 68 planes that Air India recently order from Boeing. They will also see American businesses like General Electric and Microsoft and Intel who are in India to learn about the needs of local customers and do vital research that makes their products more competitive in world markets. The United States will not give into the protectionists and lose these opportunities. For the sake of workers in both our countries, America will trade with confidence".⁵⁰

Here is some rough data on the current values of retail trade in India. There is more data , gender disaggregated as well as size and ownership wise, but I am giving this data only as indicative of the treasure we have built, which we are going to lose.

Total enterprises of which retail trade	: 39.8 %
Rural	: 36.1 %
Urban	: 44.2 %

Workers (in millions)

Retail trade	: 18.54
Rural	: 7.88
Urban	: 10.65

Further out of (the total of) 30.35 million enterprises 80.4 % were self-financing, 5.15 % did not use fuel of any kind and 5.14% did not need premises. The percentage of these who were financed by institutional finance or irdp, and other poverty alleviation programmes were all less than 1%! Imagine what they do with in the context of our power shortages etc?

The entry of FDI with the intention so clearly stated in the news item quoted above would exterminate this treasure and put our scattered consumers apart

⁵⁰ George W Bush in his speech at Purana Qila, New Delhi on 1 March 2006 (<http://www.whitehouse.gov/news/releases/2006/03/20060303-5.html>)

from our traders into the new spaces of suicides.- we will throw away the sine qua non, of our economy, i.e. small farms and small businesses ...

Here is an area, for Indian women to do a Satya graha, a fistful of salt* for the women's movement to rally around OPPOSING FDI. But we did not.**

This rapid rate of GDP has created not only greater disparities, but visible distances between the privileged, and the others. Further it has happened very fast , within say the last five years, going back to the last say 10 years , and there has been little time to accommodate rapid changes that are taking place in life styles .There is also disparity in the spaces and sectors in terms of growth. For example:

Agriculture growing only at less than 3% according to the latest document the Approach to the 11th Plan 2007-12⁵¹. Farmers are committing suicide, unable to repay their loans taken against expected crop prices.⁵² Handloom weavers are committing suicide due to imitation and cheaper mill made goods from China . Youth are breaking the glass panes of high profile multinational stores and burnings buses and effigies for the smallest irritations. Naxalism i.e. violent resistance and revolution is gripping the young in areas where the the majority of the populations is of the indigenous bal/people.

The latest protests are against farm land being sold by the governments to corporates for manufacture of cars, or export goods as in the SEZs [Special Export Zones]

Opening up the economy to competition has meant not only import if goods, often only to cater to the new middle class disposable income – an outcome of the IT outsourcing employment ,but has made India a favourite destination for marketing foreign goods as was described above in relation to Walmart..

In an economy where the unemployment is chronic and huge, and there is no unemployment insurance, such initiatives by the State and the Corporates evoke anger and violence, -every small irritation, erupts in burning of public property, smashing of corporate offices physical damage, mob fury .This is a new phenomena in what was a tolerant society.

For those of us who are familiar with the African and Latin American continents, and the convulsions they went through due to the divides, and

⁵¹ **“Towards Faster and More Inclusive Growth”**, An Approach to the 11th Five Year Plan, Planning Commission, Government of India, November, 2006

⁵² Mihir Shah, “Killing fields of 21st century India”, *The Hindu*, December 18, 2006; P. Sainath, “It’s official: distress up, suicides appalling”, *The Hindu*, December 18, 2006

their re vival to day , after many decades, into near socialist states, Indias current journey is full of portent, we see breakdown of civic order, more crime and convulsions

Why this is very dangerous , more than in Latin America etc is because of India's huge population, and huge and deep poverty , a kind of poverty that startles even visitors from other continents of the south ⁵³

VI

Where would I like us to go

However here I want to argue that while there is a problematique related to our challenges in constructing identity, in constructing theory, our **gyana**, if applied, adds value to the precision of public policy. The neglect of this knowledge in reverse, undermines if not mis-directs public policy.

I would therefore suggest that the playing field is shifted from strategies, lobbying and advocacy to an argument that the neglect of this knowledge is distorting. I would then propose to the Women's Movement that if they see knowledge as their greatest contribution and claim themselves as knowledge creators, they can move themselves from being perceived as victims, as the discriminated against , as the excluded or as Sen says , as patients to intellectuals

Amartya Sen has provided an argument to drop what he calls the need based approach, replacing it with the rights based approach. He picturises it by talking of people as patients who have needs and ends with a quotation about slaves.

"We need a vision of mankind not as patients whose interests have to be looked after, but as agents who can do effective things – both individually and jointly."

Amartya Sen calls this claiming of a right and the capability to exercise it agency. But I would like to use the word intellectuals, in order to shift perceptions from the body to the mind and indeed, as you will understand and appreciate that the mind/ body dichotomy, - even if it is a category mistake, as Kant would claim, a proposition that is rejected by modern science and all of us, - does have embedded hierarchies in it.

⁵³ From What Now to What Next: Reflections on three decades of international politics and development Praful Bidwai what Next Vol. 1 setting the Context Development Dialogue No. 47 June 2006 (pp 29-62)

But can we forge a common identity? An agreed vision?

I suggest we can. Not on bodily marking or other classification but “vision” and I illustrate this viewpoint by referring to the debates around racism.

In response to Apartheid in South Africa, “the other”, namely the enslaved, had to build a strong mass-based platform where the identity had to be on a single pole. Any attempt to highlight pluralism - multiplicity of characteristics such as male-female, rich-poor, urban-rural, educated- uneducated, Christian-non Christian - would not have enabled the black consciousness Movement to bring together the kind of courage and sacrifice that pushed back and undid the White regime in South Africa. The more the oppressor pressed his attitude, the more the oppressed recognised his weakness and absurdity. It was this non- slave mentality, the self- confidence of the blacks, their pride and knowledge that the adversary was creating myths, shrouding himself in a glass cage, that finally brought together the black consciousness and the anti-racism movement, eroding the self- confidence of the white minority.

The WCAR⁵⁴ , the World Conference Against Racism held in Durban, South Africa, in 2001, exposed a great deal, both about the nuances and issues around the concept of racism as well as the ideas and analysis of the intersections between gender, class, caste and race. To listen to the types of language and also the sense of pain and anger that pervaded all the discourse, had a salutary effect, as it brought back once again some of the earlier concerns of feminists, namely that they need to identify themselves with 'the worst off'. The worst off were those who were caught in the intersection of all the isms including poverty.

The air at the venue - was one of conflict, conflict between peoples within countries, clearly addressed to a given adversary, mostly expressed as information, but often also expressed in hate language and finger pointing. This explicitness, added a kind of clarity and power to the event, usually missing in other such conferences be they about women, population, poverty or children. Narratives talked of a life of fear, from the very childhood – being marked as thieves, polluters, bodies to be used and thrown aside, kept outside the systems of justice and security under one pretext or the other. Of being deprived of

⁵⁴ Devaki Jain, for World Conference Against Racism (WCAR) NGO Forum Durban, South Africa 2001, Session 1 and 2 Part II *“Interlocking Dimensions of Difference and Power in Human Rights Conflicts and Racism in Culturally Diverse Experiences”*

rights to not only to land, property and knowledge, but also right to their bodies, especially for the women.

A feminist from South Asia, at the conference said – *this conference can re-politicise the feminist movement*, since the women were usually within a racially discriminated group and spoke of experiences of racism, thus emphasising the ugliest face of discrimination. As the people were mostly those who were at the bottom of the ladder of social exclusion and stigma, there was a kind of class focus, thus highlighting the fact, that the rights framework has to be embedded in economic issues such as poverty. This seemed another very important lesson and it was impressive to see that the only luminary who addressed this frontally was President Thabo Mbeki of South Africa. (Mbeki, 2001)⁵⁵

At the conference there were workshops on the intersection between feminism and racism and the forging of identities. There was a view that identity cannot and should not be forged on bodily markings, like race or gender ie woman, but on an ethical or political perspective .For example, Barbara Phillips⁵⁶ asks:“ Is it desirable to forge this primary identity as “Woman”? What are the implications for other aspects of identity? Must we be “Woman” first? If so, then what does each woman enter in the category of “second”, “third”? Is this primary identity preferable to an “intersectional” identity? Does this primary identity break the bonds as well as the “chains” of cultural context?

If the primary identity of “Woman” is desirable, what are the enabling conditions for its emergence? To take a crude example, during the era of lawful slavery in the United States, surely there was no possibility of primary identity as “woman” for the slave-owning woman and the slave woman.”

She continues, and considers, what I would call a perspective or an ideology, as a more meaningful basis for unity, than woman, because of the history, in this case of racial oppression. “I would like to examine the function of identity as a force for social movement solidarity. Can we explore the function of “physical characteristic” identity as compared to “belief in a vision of justice” characteristic? Was the solidarity among South African Blacks forged upon “physical characteristic” identity or a transformative “belief in a vision of justice”? Is this inquiry even appropriately “either/or”; perhaps it is a matter of some primary characteristic identity that merges or plows the soil through

⁵⁵ Thabo Mbeki, ‘*We Must Combine To Defeat Consequences Of Slavery, Colonialism And Racism*’, RD/D/7, August 31, 2001.

⁵⁶ Private communication to Devaki Jain. Barbara Phillips was the program officer for gender and rights in the Ford Foundation

shared experience for the receptiveness to a transformative vision of a just society....."

In a paper called "*What does it take to Become a Citizen? Some neglected collective identities in building nation*" a dialogue between Lord Meghad Desai and Amartya Sen I argued that drawing together data on infantile sex ratios, trafficking of women, HIV/AIDS incidence and its implications, and the work spaces that poor women occupy, it can be proved that large masses of women have not been included in citizenship.⁵⁷ Their right to dignity and their bodies are being violated and there is homogeneity in this incarceration. The woman identity in this condition of subject hood, nay slavery supercedes many of the more recognized identities for example in the Indian landscape, such as Muslim or Hindu, ethnicity and caste, and sometimes even class. While the women's movement is acknowledged as part of various struggles, for a Meghad Desai, I argued that today, in India women are a "nation" in search of citizenship. I also showed how location in poverty exacerbates all these attacks.

Part of the reason this excluded nation within a nation is largely invisible is that other identities invariably supercede the identity of "woman." Political parties in India have not taken the political identity of women seriously as a nation-building force or identity.

I mentioned earlier the fluidity of women's identities. Their capacity within one "body" to be multicultural, take on meanings of class, caste and yet they throw them away when they need to bond as women for a struggle. We have the examples of the Chipko movement in the UP Hills, the anti arrack movement in Andhra and so many others in India which reveal the collective will of women across the conventional identities for protecting nature or family⁵⁸. They perhaps have the most sophisticated view of identity.

VII

Can we forge a common identity drawing on our gyana to relieve women of poverty ?

⁵⁷ Devaki Jain, "*What Does It Take to Become a Citizen? Some neglected collective identities in building nation*" prepared for Democracy, Communalism, Secularism and the Dilemmas of Indian Nationhood, December 2004

⁵⁸ Devaki Jain, "Development as if Women Mattered or can Women Build a New Paradigm? Lecture at OEDC/DAC Meeting, Paris, January, 1983

There is in my view a decline in the power of women's movement not only in India but worldwide – a decline in our effective influence over local, national and global political economy. Simultaneously there is worldwide recognition that if the highly conflict driven, and unequal unjust phenomena that all our countries are experiencing is to be diverted into a more domain track, then it can only be if women lead. Thus there is a recognition of what we are able to do, in my view we are not doing it.

So how can we regain some of that aura of the 50's and 60's? How can we throw up more Kamaladevi's and Akka Mahadevis to mention some Indian women revolutionary in development. Is that not a possibility in the world of today?

We need to build a *theory of inclusive growth* – call it gross world happiness or peace ; but as an economist I am perhaps inclined to see how it is economic growth, wealth and money that seems to be driving our leaders , thus our political economies ... and so to match the enemy's weapons I want to see if we can create another theory where countries do grow, in other words do enable its citizens to prosper, do eradicate poverty , do provide legal and other securities such as human rights to its citizens , but not in the trampling way that current policies and programs do .

Just to give it a short hand value , I say our aim is to replace Das Kapital and the Wealth of Nations: two books and two men whose imagination has captured the minds of world leaders for decades ...

I had similarly proposed to the South Commission in 1988-89 that it was of no use merely showing the inadequacies of what is called the dominant North derived paradigm, but one had to re-think at the hard economic level, the theories of growth, and build into them political goals such as poverty eradication, equity- somewhat in the way Gandhi did when he insisted that political liberation is inadequate without economic liberation of the downtrodden.

The first step in reconstruction needs to be the paradigm of development itself, the identification of the engines of growth. Instead of seeing the poor as a target group, who need special ladders, within a framework of economic development, - enabling the poor to become economic and political agents could itself become the engine of growth. Thus from a "trickle down", or social net approach, it would be useful to look at what can be called the "bubbling up" theory of growth. This alternative theory would argue that putting incomes and political power in the hands of the poor could generate the demand and the voice that would direct development. The purchasing power and the choices of the poor could direct the economy to a pro poor or poverty reducing economy. The review of the past seems to suggest some

dramatic reversal of the current theories of where the engine of growth lies, if the interest is in poverty eradication.

Fortunately, the world is also moving into the mode of challenging what is called the dominant paradigm.

The “indicator” movement is an old story - Barefoot Economics of Manfred Max Neef, Hazel Henderson’s Beyond Economics, PQLI of Morris David Morris, TOES, are all about “new” indicators or measures of economic and social transformation. In the 80's and 90's they did not seem radical enough as a means to re-order the content of development. But indicators are coming back, almost like a movement and may become the tail that wags the dog. For example, a group in USA (Cobb, Halstead & Rowe, 1995) is illustrating that increases in crime, individualization of family, (absence of social support) etc. adds to GDP in the USA: and have coined the slogan “Growth in GDP is Social decay” . Their “target” is the Wall Street Journal as the “pace setter” for US growth. There are worldwide networks of indicator - wallahs who wish to consolidate their power to demand new measures to measure progress. All of this to re-constitute “production”, re-value its measures and influence consumption: as well as to show the political premises of measures.

There are more new measures such as poverty capability measure. There’s a social capacity measure. Social capacity measures the capacity (seen in terms of membership, participation in meetings) of various diverse, especially disadvantaged sections of the population in such “support” institutions. There is a develop a political expression measure a democracy measure that was used in one of the HDRs.

The Empire Strikes Back: The new resistance: the mass movements

There is also the many massive gatherings of resistance e.g. The Asian Social Forum, (Hyderabad, India January 2003 had a gathering of 14,000 persons, who identified the adversary as the “empire” – re invoking the imperialism of earlier eras. The vitality of the numerous identities, like dalits, displaced persons, unorganised workers and their ability to share a common space, to understand and collectively decide to find alternatives to the current political and economic regimes and the theories that back them up could be seen as a defining moment for the “Empire to strike back” (Jain 2003)⁵⁹.

At the World Social Forum in Porte Alegre, that followed the Asian Social Forum, Arundhati Roy had this to say: “the disparity between the rich and the

⁵⁹ Devaki Jain, ‘*The Empire Strikes Back*’, Economic and Political Weekly, Jan 11, 2003

poor grows, the fight to corner resources is intensifying. To push through their "sweetheart deals," to corporatize the crops we grow, the water we drink, the air we breathe, and the dreams we dream, corporate globalization needs an international confederation of loyal, corrupt, authoritarian governments in poorer countries to push through unpopular reforms and quell the mutinies..... Corporate Globalization - or shall we call it by its name? – Imperialism - needs a press that pretends to be free. It needs courts that pretend to dispense justice.

So this - all this - is "empire." This loyal confederation, this obscene accumulation of power, this greatly increased distance between those who make the decisions and those who have to suffer them." (Roy 2003)⁶⁰

Thus identity would not only need to go back to the non social categories, i.e. to the economically poor, i.e. class but also to approaches to removing of discrimination. There are modes and models for eliminating distance, and there by eliminating the phenomena of intolerance.

One exemplar that comes to mind is Gandhi and his modes of eliminating those differences that lead to violence. Also to move beyond tolerance, beyond accommodation to absorption. Gandhi's ethic was actually to efface difference through absorption of the other. Symbolic gestures were used with great effect. Inequality, discrimination were his main "target".

For example, to overcome the distance between class, namely deprivation and some minimal consumer satisfaction, he dressed like a poor man making the two identities into one and would only live like a poor man in order to both experience it to identify himself with the poor as well as to generate a motivation in the poor and in others to remove poverty. To overcome the stigma of untouchability related to scavenging, he cleaned night soil from pit latrines and took the bodily stigma of night soil cleaning both in order to identify himself with this or "dirty" task as well as to draw attention to the injustice.

To enable women to attack the stereo typing of roles which stigmatises and subordinates women, he transposed roles in the ashrams. Women would come to his marches and public peaceful boycotts, men were also asked to weave and sew and cook. Women were advised to cease to be an ornament for men to enjoy and if necessary to boycott sexual advances in order to resist male supremacy.

There is an idea here – it is perhaps the only strategy, namely the identification with the poor, with which a united stand could in fact eradicate poverty. There is morality, but there is also hard core politics and attention to economics. It seems

⁶⁰ Arundhati Roy, 'Confronting Empire', World Social Forum, Port Alegre, Brazil Jan 2003.

a mental effort is required to efface multiple identities, while adopting a politics to remove the discrimination against the “poor”?

It leads to consumption restraint an environmental safeguard: A different basket of goods for production: as well as differentless energy demanding and polluting technologies. Women’s brilliant struggles, need to be treated as a BODY of knowledge, chiseled into **theory**, into an intellectual challenge to what “is” i.e. the currently dominant ideas for national and international advancement. The importance of an **intellectual theoretical construct** out of the ground experience, which can claim **space** in the world of theoretical discourse, cannot be minimized.

We need to look at the innumerable struggles of innumerable groups of women which has been transformatory in every direction: environment, livelihood institutional and prepare a new **theoretical magnum opus**.

A lesson that can be drawn from poor women’s actions is the importance of identifying one purpose. . The ideological imperative is given by the purpose. Thus the problems of forging an identity as women or similar categories, discussed above , and the ideas proposed by Barbara Phillips, Faye Harrison, Amartya Sen, and if I may submit, Marx and Gandhi and myself, namely to identify a common purpose, a or an ethic, or a class as the binding force, is shown to be possible by the review and understanding of struggles in which poor or life threatened groups of women have engaged

The poor are politicised around poverty - especially its deprivational and discriminatory aspects. What is needed is to give effective mechanisms for articulating this politics The poor in India are not wretched nor passive, nor really overpowered by poverty. They are terribly deprived of all aspects of physical well being - they are literally worked to death by the society and the environment but they are not pessimistic. They are aware, alert, carving spaces for themselves against all odds

An aspect of the poor that is a paradox, is understandable, though it looks contradictory – is that they are able to come together in collective actions with spontaneity and courage; and at the same time, are able to hurt, paralyse each other in the fight for survival. Thus there is great conflict and ‘flea biting flea’ amongst the poor, as there is also the ability to come together for massive resistance. And amongst the poor women organize resistance with greater solidarity across conventional divides than men, is what ground experience teaches us

Given below are some illustrations first from India and also from other

regions. [Participants or Casablanca dreamers can add to this list from their own work and experience]

The Anti-Arrack struggle in Andhra Pradesh of India. A video documentary by Friedrich Ebert Stiftung of the Andhra women's anti-arrack struggle is called 'When Women Unite', Reworking Gender Relations, Redefining Politics: Nellore Village Women Against Arrack", Based on the report from Anveshi, Hyderabad, Economic and Political Weekly, Jan. 16-23, 1993 is one such. Arrack, (a locally brewed liquor) has been the bane of many women in tribal and rural areas. The poverty of the households in such areas was perpetuated by the expenditure of the earnings of the men on the liquor. With liquor consumption, came the associated problems of wife-battering, drunken and disorderly behaviour and increased crime. Pushed to the limits the women of the District of Nellore fought back through collective agitation. The agitation spread like wild fire convulsing the entire state of Andhra Pradesh for three years. They reached the pinnacle of success when they forced the Telugu Desam Government to declare prohibition. Caste and religion were notable by their absence to divide the movement as it struck every woman's home without discrimination. So the issue itself went beyond caste and religion. There were as many Muslim and 'backward' class women as there were other religions and castes. (Refer to a report on the National Workshop on Women engaged in Anti-Arrack struggles, jointly organized by National Commission for Women and Mahila Haat)

I give below a chart I prepared to reveal the kind of issues that women take up and at the same time to show that they are able to present collective resistance with new techniques of satya graha.

IAWS WOMEN'S COLLECTIVE ACTION CHART⁶¹							
Sl. No.	Place	Nellore 1992-93	Khiralote 1982	Imphal (city) 1989-90	Manek Chowk (city), 1993	Assam 1980	Manipur 1979
1.	Issue	Arrack (local or country liquor)	Quarrying traditional market	Relocating rebuilding	Relocating vendors	Eviction from land colony	Liquor
2.	Action Base	Village	Village	Market	Market	Housing colony	All State
3.	Basis of Social Homogeneity	Dalit/Muslim	Kumaon tribe	One tribe (Maithei)	Occupation (vegetable vending)	One tribe	Maithei
4.	Technique						

	<p>a. Turned back (through "sit-in")</p> <p>b. "Dramatics"</p> <p>c. Slogans</p>	<p>Jeeps</p> <p>Cooked rice thrown in front of arrack sellers.</p> <p>No jeep to carry sick but jeep to carry arrack</p>	<p>Donkey-carriers</p> <p>Reducing width of donkey tracks, so they fall.</p> <p>Girls have no road to go to school, but donkey's have.</p>	<p>Police and Coporation</p> <p>Slept in market at night with lanterns and mosquito nets.</p> <p>From women's market to outside dunkandar's (shopkeeper's) markets.</p>	<p>Police, jeeps and Corporation</p> <p>Slept on pavements all night.</p> <p>Cars for the rich but no 'shop' selling space for poor (as it was to be a car park).</p>	<p>Elephants</p> <p>Worshipping elephants to distract from their destructive role.</p>	<p>Men</p> <p>Patrolled streets at night with lathis (sticks)</p>
5.	Men's Behaviour	Low profile: two-way support (no gender conflict at village level).	Low profile: Supportive (no gender conflict at village level).	Nowhere in the picture.	Supportive (locally)	Low profile: Supportive (locally)	Men were point of attack. Retaliation.
6.	<p>Support</p> <p>a. Initial impetus</p> <p>b. Focal point</p>	<p>Literacy primer (curriculum)</p> <p>Jana Vignana Vedika</p>	<p>Gandhi an padayatra (on foot) visiting houses, letting people speak up. Building confidence to think and act.</p> <p>Lakshmi Ashram</p>	<p>Historical strength of women's collectives in Manipur</p> <p>NUPILAN</p>	<p>Trade union method/Gandhi an Satyagraha</p> <p>SEWA</p>	<p>Gandhi an Ashram's extension to assist rights.</p> <p>Gandhian Asharam</p>	<p>Historical strength.</p> <p>NUPILAN</p>
7.	The State's controlling instrument	Auction of liquor/giving of licenses	Auction of quarries/giving of licenses	Urban development traffic nuisance.	Urban development traffic nuisance	To develop land	Liquor shops licensed
8.	Outcome	Arrack auction sales stopped in Andhra	Quarry closed even at a loss to contractor of Rs. 1 lakh	New market project abandoned. Old market to	Court order. The pavement (entitlement). Manek Chowk	Don't know.	Prohibition bill brought into Assam (but no

		Pradesh.	(court order)	be renovated in consultations with the women.	belongs to the women vendors.		follow-up)
--	--	----------	---------------	---	-------------------------------	--	------------

Source:60 Refer to “Women’s Collective Action Chart” in *Minds Bodies and Exemplars: Reflections at Beijing and Beyond* by Devaki Jain and published by British Council Division, 1996, page 15-16 *Leadership Gap : A Challenge to Women studies* ????, Presidential Address , Devaki Jain, Indian Association of women studies, Mysore

Four Indian Women lead the most effective transformatory struggles in India today. Medha Patkar spearheads the movement against big dams and for the conservation of natural resources.⁶² Aruna Roy spearheads the right to information movement in India, for political transparency.⁶³ Ela Bhatt for rights of home-based workers to legal protection. ⁶⁴ Vandana Shiva for rights over the seed.⁶⁵

My own view would be that such collective resistance and collective positive movements are even more required today than ever before.and we should support and strengthen collective public actions as well as projects ie grass roots activism.

Today there is greater inequality within nations, between nations, between regions, between classes. There is a rumbling under the ground which will burst into extraordinary violence and India perhaps will enter into a behavioural pattern which she so far has avoided - namely intolerance and criminalisation of the youth and the deprived, as it has happened in so many other developing the countries.

There is need to capture an idea, something like Gandhiji’s fistful of salt^{66*} which turned around imperialism, unite a round it to show that the women’s movement

⁶² Dilip D'Souza's book, *The Narmada Dammed: An Inquiry Into the Politics of Development*, (New Delhi, Penguin, 2002)

⁶³ K Srivastava, N. Dey and N. Mishra, ‘Taking democracy forward: The right to information movement in Rajasthan’, paper presented at the technical workshop on Indigenizing Human Rights Education in Indian Universities, Karnataka Women’s Information and Resource Centre, Bangalore, December, 2001

⁶⁴ Renana Jhabvala, ‘Sewa and home-based workers in India: Their struggle and emerging role’, paper presented at the technical workshop on Indigenizing Human Rights Education in Indian Universities, Karnataka Women’s Information and Resource Centre, Bangalore, December, 2001

⁶⁵ Vandana Shiva is a Director of Navadanya. An international Conference organised by Navadanya, New Delhi India International Centre, New Delhi; 29th September to 1st October 2001

⁶⁶ The Salt Satyagraha of 1930 was a non-violent struggle for freedom from colonial rule, on a countrywide scale. The mode was a long march on foot to the sea front where salt is manufactured, where Gandhi picked up a fistful of salt , to rebel against the salt tax , symbolic of civil disobedience , a form of rebellion .

stands for something.

VIII

Some ideas for the future

Today there are a few chinks in the armour into which we can wedge our creativity and our moral energies. Some are simple but they could be the thin end of the wedge –I would try to divide them into ---domains

1. Macro economic policy
2. Institutions
3. Identification with issues : struggling out of our own bondage on identity
4. Identification with larger political affirmations

1. Macro economic policy

- A response to globalisation

In responses to Globalisation, the women's movement and those who are working in women and economics are not only content with rethinking, with protesting against Globalisation because of the universally understood class and gender segmented impact that it has, but in finding a space for the mobilization of the women's movement to develop a counter revolutionary force.

My basic argument would be that we need to shift our attention from the broad term globalisation to the term regulation. I suggest that the current preoccupation, whether it is in the forums of the finance ministries of nations, or the international economic organisations, in which I include the Bretton Woods Institutions (BWI's) and WTO the issue is regulation, a paradigm or quantum shift from the message deregulate. Stiglitz latest book, Ref

The questions of disputation are of what, how much, where, under whose control? The word regulation, the very anti thesis of liberalisation and free trade, has found its way back into legitimacy, due to the experience of the last 10-15 years of the global mantra, the formula that was being applied across the board, as the road to prosperity. ⁶⁷ Feminists would find words like regulation

⁶⁷ **I WOULD GIVE EXAMPLES OF THIS RETURN. THIS REVIVAL OF INTEREST IN THE MODES OF REGULATION. IN THE PAPER. MOST OF**

abhorrent with their of the liberal attitudes. But regulatory mechanisms, which protect workers rights which regulate TNC's imports which hurt etc. need to be brought back.

- ❑ To deconstruct globalisation to its various forms, and a new composition of what can be a benign form of globalisation designed by women, especially women politicians from the local government. Thus convergence of interest whether it is globalisation or macro economic policy, depends on opportunity for women, especially women in electoral politics, representing people as voters, to design the macro policies. **An organization of dalits, in Tumkur District IN Karnataka, who have developed an experience of dalit based local government, have come to the view , that the best way for them to reclaim their voice, is for them to forge identity throught the ballot box, through block voting, as otherwise their multiple identities , prevents their claiming voice ...here is a thought for the women?**
- ❑ To support new theories like the bubbling up theory of growth, where the engines of growth and determination of production and export plans begin with the poor and their choices .[see above...also proposed by Gandhi] This can be modernized by ideas such as given by Caren Grown and ---- , on stimulating growth through a livelihood security and wage employment led growth path [see refs and extracts in Shubha Chacko's review].This can also be coincided with regionalism , the regional trade agreements which are the mode to day in developing countries, by suggesting that the goals of the regional trade compact would be to maximize employment in the region, so models can be built where the maximization would be employment, rather than merely foreign exchange.
- ❑ To consider new measures of progress such as Gross National Happiness and others innovations which reveal the value of human well being , of equality and social justice...inclusive growth . Some of the feminist economists have elaborated on how trade led growth which neglects women, or gendered analysis , by passes human well being

**THE DETAILS AND REFERENCES ARE IN MY NITA BARROW
MEMORIAL LECTURE GIVEN AT THE UNIVERSITY OF WEST INDIES, IN
BARBADOS IN NOVEMBER 1999.**

- ❑ To consider new concepts of social and economic transformation, such as the ideas given by the author of Chapter 3 in the book forthcoming , called MAINSTREAM, HETERODOX, AND FEMINIST TRADE THEORY Ed by Nilüfer Çağatay, Diane Elson, and Caren Grown. The author argues that alternative (or heterodox) trade theories reject the idea that trade liberalization will lead to economic growth and improved allocation of national resources from inefficient import substitutes to more efficient exportable goods.
- ❑ To bring to bear a vision which sees, as one feminist economist has put it *Who benefits ?*: by –same person, namely the least privileged, the most deprived as the goal of all policies and theories

2. Institutions

- ❑ To stand for protection of women’s livelihoods and the organized power of workers whether they are in the formal or informal economy. To my mind worker organizations whether they are home-based workers or outsource workers or factory based workers is the critical institutional safeguard against the march of the corporate. We see that being whittled away and replaced by flexilabour , loose secondary contracts and so on. Labour laws are being dismantled, special export zones in India are tax free and labour unions are banned. Worker organizations are an institutional arrangement that we need to stand for
- ❑ To build the theory of growth from this – therefore to make a space for Labour Unions.
- ❑ To generate a strong political move for women to reclaim Democracy and Development through the mobilization of those engaged locally, through the concept of the inverted pyramid, and the concept of think locally and act globally (not the other way around), spreading wide, or bubbling up to become a tidal wave at the macro or global level.

In India, we attempt not to use this term, but we name our attempts as “ building **local self government**” The connotation is to build UPWARDS, government and democracy from the local to the State (provincial) level and on wards to the National level. Thus the excluding process, implied in the term subsidiarity is reversed. The local decides what the upper levels do

If we wish to enable local or localisation of power, of development management to enable **Voice**, then the larger space must permit disagreement, protest,

diversity, pluralism i.e. be democratic. Thus it is important not to be inhibited, and to find some core elements within the various forms of decentralisation which can restructure the organisation of society, which can shift gender relations and which can allow the upturned pyramid, i.e. the spreading of local to global.

- ❑ **To suggest that participation, for excluded groups, for the poor is most valuable when it is in politics** The heart of the women's question lies in gender-relations; the inequality in power, in autonomy between men and women; and the redressal of this inequality/lack of autonomy for women is contingent on their political presence - their visibility - in conventional politics. (This was also strongly affirmed in Beijing in 1995 by the World Wide Women's Movement).^{68 69} Work out institutional architecture.
- ❑ Eliminating inequality between men and women would be the key to the door which ushers in justice for all. Discrimination against women is a universal discrimination within discrimination. Hence political restructuring by itself, namely decentralisation of political management, is not enough. There for Economic Restructuring has to match political restructuring

These institutional suggestions may appear as well trodden ground. However it is interesting to find that in recent articles (2002 Winter)⁷⁰, on 'Globalism And The World's Poor' both Dr. Joseph E Stiglitz, former Economic Adviser for World Bank and Nobel Laureate, and Prof. Amartya Sen also a Nobel Laureate, speak about the importance of institutions - leading to regulatory mechanisms.

Prof. Sen spells out what could be called necessary conditions for the safe landing of globalisation and the list is entirely around various types of

⁶⁸ Conference Journeys: What Have We Not Done? Were Have We Gone Wrong? CONGO Presentation Jun. 2000

⁶⁹ The Beijing conference, namely the fourth world women's conference (1995) drew particular attention to the neglect of women in political structures all over the world and the importance of bringing women into political structures. [1995, UNDP Human Development Report]. This report has excellent data world wide showing that world wide women have very little share in political processes - whether it is political parties, Parliaments etc.

On the contrary, women have always been very active in politics, if politics is taken to be the broader theatre of struggle for rights. For example, women have been very prominent in freedom struggles Therefore it is not for lack of political consciousness that women are not in politics, - but they have not been given the opportunity to translate the consciousness into what is called formal political expression.

⁷⁰ The American Prospect, Winter 2002

institutional arrangements and provisions of social services on the ground. He has a subheading 'Institutions and Inequality'.

3. Identification with issues: struggling out of our own bondage on identity

- ❑ By identifying ourselves with justice and equality, or as Faye Harrison has said (In equality) , with the down trodden as Gandhi would say, or the discriminated against and the hungry , by having a vision as most of the feminists we reviewed have argued as super ceding all the challenges to forging identity, like woman or race , we may be able to build our voice .
- ❑ Challenging the knowledge : androcentric and eurocentric and rebuilding knowledge together is a bonding that I think has scope for solidarity

4. Identification with larger political affirmations of the south

I would like to end by pointing to the relevance of the **NAM [non aligned movement]**, as an umbrella for safeguarding women's interests and changing the world order, building peace into globalization

There is a case again for NAM to offer the political umbrella , that it once did, for bringing collective action and institutions to protect women migrants as well as to collectively enforce a common set of negotiating principles, for outsourcing and other put out work, so that this race to the bottom can be stopped.

The current situation of the participation of women in the trend of globalization with special emphasis on expanding trade reveals the need for the NAM movement to once again see the role of women, as principal actors, agents in the economic field, and give special attention to that identification.

It is women who are the **major migrants** as well as **exploited workers** in this new trend of roving TNCs looking for cheaper labour and less stringent labour laws. The feminization of labor migration is particularly pronounced in the Philippines, Indonesia and Sri Lanka, where national-level estimates indicate that women comprise 60-75 percent of legal migrants, many of whom are employed as domestic workers in the Middle East and Asia.

In developing countries, while outsourcing provides new employment opportunities, these are concentrated in low-wage/low value-added activities. In many cases, countries do not specialize in producing a particular product ; instead, they specialize in supplying low cost labour. Moreover, workers in such productive activities face intense competitive pressures from other workers around the globe. Under such conditions, countries stand a real risk of running a

"race to the bottom" in which competitive conditions keep the returns to labour low. Again women are concentrated in the lower end of these activities.

Some regions like Latin America having entered these territories of outsourcing of production by North America, much earlier than Africa and Asia, taking note of some of these outcomes, have set up institutions to protect and provide the knowledge to policy making spaces. For example in 1997 a Women's Commission was formed in Latin America, within the regional labour confederation, which issued a set of demands to both organized labour and government officials. A Gender advisory unit was created within Mercosur, designed to ensure that gender issues are dealt with by the alliance's top decision-making bodies. These initiatives could be broadened to cover all the continents that make up the NAM membership.

Our outputs /outcomes need to be inducted offered to the NAM spaces

Notes annexures

NAM

Questions are being raised on the relevance of the Non Aligned Movement, NAM. NAM is seen in its literal meaning, as being a neutral space, and separating itself from the cold war adversaries, the East, socialist: and the West liberal or capitalist. Two powerful blocs and therefore irrelevant in the new world order, where those blocs do not exist ...

But this was not only what NAM worked and stood for. Nam was a rallying call superceding all differences, for liberation from both colonial and other, such as ideological, domination. NAM was a movement for claiming sovereignty for the newly liberated nations from super powers, as also the independence to design their future from their own history, culture and economic landscapes. Sovereignty and liberation were the key words.

The movement offered a political umbrella for forging solidarity on many issues and subjects especially related to the excluded, the discriminated against, to budge themselves out of what is conventionally called the modernization project on development co-operation, the Marshall Plan driven proposals from the UN in the 60s and the 70s. NAM's role in nudging women out of that trap, is worth recalling, as it points to where the movement can find a role for itself in the 21st Century.

The NAM's model of the path to women's equality departed from UN strategies; the UN system at this time saw "women's status" as a social development issue that was not connected to the larger context of international development. Within the UN women were still viewed as resources whose potential could be tapped, not as political and economic agents in the development of their countries. But the NAM movement and gatherings offered a space where the women from these former colonies could reassert the standpoint that they were active agents in their nations, contributors to their country's progress, not just consumers of social services.

The NAM was a strong and supportive presence, though physically invisible, in the UN conferences on women. Its attention to women's contributions to economic development was sparked by the UN's International Women's Year. The Ministerial Conference of the Non-Aligned Countries that was held in Lima in August 1975, which took place right after the Mexico City conference, strongly supported and reiterated the Plan of Action, the document that emerged from the Mexico conference. This support was reaffirmed in the many conferences that followed, including the Fifth Summit Conference of Heads of State of Government of Non-Aligned Countries in Colombo in 1976 and the Conference of Foreign Ministers of Non-Aligned Countries in Belgrade in 1978.

The NAM passed a series of resolutions on the issue of economic development in succeeding conferences, culminating in its Conference of Non-Aligned and Other Developing Countries on the Role of Women in Baghdad in 1979. Representatives from forty-five developing nations attended the conference, and the UN sent observers from the ILO, ECWA, the UNDP, the United Nations Industrial Development Organization (UNIDO), and the WHO. As a result of dialogues in conference venues, the NAM saw women's role in development as an international and political issue, in contrast to its earlier conceptualization of issues relating to women's status as social or cultural phenomena.

The NAM consultations introduced a more nuanced understanding of concepts that had seemed fairly straightforward, for example the idea of discrimination. Delegates from developing countries saw discrimination as "part of a system of exploitation in every country as well as within the international economic and political order." In contrast, delegates from developed countries tended to see it only in the context of male dominance.

By the time of the UN's Mid-Decade Review Conference in Copenhagen, the movement's analysis of women in development had sharpened to a complex understanding of "the interconnection between trends in women's roles and status in their societies and the nature and pattern of the development processes, including the latter's dependence on international, economic, and political

relations."1. This model of development grew from a deep understanding of the realities of women's lives in developing countries

The conference report stated that "the inequality of women in most countries stems to a very large extent from mass poverty and general backwardness of the majority of the world's population caused by underdevelopment which is a product of imperialism, colonialism, neo-colonialism and also of unjust international economic relations." This was a very different statement than the one in the report of the Mexico City conference just five years before, which had focused on equality with men through legal means.

Since the NAM was in many ways a collective resistance against domination by either world power, East or West, socialist or capitalist, women's engagement with it enabled them to locate their struggle as one against domination, against subordination. The fading out of the Cold War led to the dimming and reduction of value of this third space, which in later years removed a vital political umbrella that had sheltered the women of the South, given them a legitimacy to stake a claim for justice as part of the movements to redress domination. It could be suggested that strong conservative alliances against women's rights were able to set back the UN's work between 1995 and 2005 in part because of the absence of this political space.